

DRAFT REPORT

**WELWYN HATFIELD BOROUGH COUNCIL
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR - PLANNING, PUBLIC PROTECTION AND GOVERNANCE**

DELEGATED APPLICATION

Application No: 6/2017/2622/LB
Location: St. Ethelreda's Church Hall Church Street Hatfield AL9 5AR
Proposal: External alterations including refurbishment of roof and internal alterations.
Officer: Mrs Sarah Madyausiku

Recommendation: Granted

6/2017/2622/LB

Context			
Site and Application description	<p>St. Ethelreda's Church Hall is a Grade II listed building dating from circa 1840, which was originally built as a school for the 2nd Marchioness of Salisbury. The listed building is constructed of red brick in the Tudor style, and has large stepped buttresses and a Dutch-gabled porch. The listed building is also located within Hatfield Conservation Area.</p> <p>The application is for internal alterations, including the removal of partition walls and ceilings, the addition of a kitchen and bar and a new hydraulic platform lift, as well as external repairs and landscaping.</p>		
Constraints (as defined within WHDP 2005)	<p>CA - Conservation Area: HATF; - Distance: 0</p> <p>LBC - LISTED BUILDING Formerly Countess Anne's School, built for 2nd - Distance: 0</p> <p>PAR - PARISH (HATFIELD) - Distance: 0</p> <p>Wards - Hatfield East - Distance: 0.75</p> <p>A4HD - Article 4 HMO Direction - Distance: 0</p>		
Relevant planning history	<p>Application Number: E6/1963/0253/ Decision: Granted Decision Date: 29 April 1963</p> <p>Proposal: Change of use from school to church hall.</p>		
Consultations			
Neighbour representations	Support: 0	Object: 0	Other: 0
Publicity	<p>Site Notice Display Date: 5 December 2017</p> <p>Site Notice Expiry Date: 26 December 2017</p> <p>Press Advert Display Date: 6 December 2017</p>		

	Press Advert Expiry Date: 20 December 2017
Summary of neighbour responses	None
Consultees and responses	Hertfordshire County Council Historic Environment Advisor- No objections subject to conditions Hatfield Town Council – No response Place Services, Essex County Council – No objection subject to conditions
Relevant Policies	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> NPPF Others: R29 <u>Draft Local Plan Proposed Submission 2016</u> SADM 15	
Main Issues	
Impact on the character and setting of the listed building and adjoining listed buildings	<p>Section 16 of the Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act states that the local planning authority shall have “<i>special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses</i>”. The specific historic environment policies within the NPPF are contained within paragraphs 126-141. Paragraph 131 of the National Planning Policy Framework (March, 2012) states, ‘<i>In determining planning applications, local planning authorities should take account of:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;</i> • <i>The positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and</i> • <i>The desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness’</i> <p>Paragraph 132 of the Framework outlines that, when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, ‘great weight’ should be given to the asset’s conservation and the more important the asset the greater the weight it should be given. Paragraph 133 states that where proposed development will lead to substantial harm or total loss of significance of a designated heritage asset, Local Planning Authorities should refuse consent unless it can be demonstrated that the harm is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh the harm. Where the harm is considered less than substantial Paragraph 134 states that this should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal. The NPPF therefore does allow for a degree of harm to a heritage asset in particular circumstances.</p> <p>Policy SADM15 of the Draft Local Plan Submission 2016 is similar in these aims.</p> <p>The alterations to the interior of the listed building involve the removal of the suspended ceiling to the entrance lobby and the removal of the internal partition walls which form the existing kitchen and bar, between the entrance lobby and the main hall. This fabric was added to the building in the late twentieth century and presently blocks views towards the roof trusses and the large window in the west gable, as well as views into the main hall. It is</p>

	<p>proposed to relocate the existing modern stair, which provides access from the entrance up to the main hall, and insert a new glazed screen between the entrance lobby and the main hall. As such, the removal of this later fabric and insertion of the glazed screen would allow the space to be opened up and provide a better understanding of the volume of the church hall. This element of the proposals is therefore considered to be a heritage benefit that would enhance the appreciation of the significance of the listed building. Details of how this fabric is to be removed should be required by condition.</p> <p>A new hydraulic lift is proposed to be inserted within the floorspace adjacent to the entrance lobby, on the south side of the building, which would likely involve the removal of historic fabric. This loss would be minimal and the proposals would not have a significant impact upon the understanding and appreciation of the special interest of the listed building.</p> <p>Within the main hall it is proposed to insert new partition walls to create a kitchen and bar 'pod' at the east end of the building. Although this 'pod' would be a reversible addition, it would block views of the window within the east gable of the listed building and would also truncate the volume of the main hall. It is therefore considered that there would be a degree of harm arising from this element of the proposals.</p> <p>It is also proposed to reconfigure the WC facilities at the west end of the building, within the flat roofed twentieth century addition. This would involve the removal of existing partition walls and the insertion of new lightweight partitions. This element of the proposals would involve the loss of some historic fabric, however, it is considered that this loss would be minimal and would not have a significant impact on the special interest of the listed building.</p> <p>Externally, the proposed works comprise repairs to the roof, walls, windows and doors. The repairs are proposed to be like-for-like, with the roof tiles to be re-used and the existing pattern with fish scale tiles retained. Additionally, the existing tarmac to the front of the building will be replaced with new tarmac to match the existing and the gravel to the car park would be overlaid with new to match the existing. Overall, these proposals are sympathetic to the listed building and would not cause harm to the significance of the listed building or the conservation area.</p> <p>In conclusion, it has been identified that the insertion of the kitchen and bar 'pod' within the volume of the main hall would result in a degree of harm to the significance of the listed building. However, when considering the scheme as a whole, this harm would be outweighed by the heritage benefit of removing the late twentieth century fabric and opening up the hall, which would allow an understanding and appreciation of the listed building's historic volume and proportions. As such, There is no objection to the granting of consent of this scheme.</p>
<p>Any other considerations</p>	<p>The proposed development is situated within Area of Archaeological Significance no. 17, as identified in the Local Plan. This covers the known extent of the medieval town of Hatfield, as well as Hatfield House and its gardens.</p> <p>Much of the proposed works would involve the removal of 1970s building fabric, which the submitted Heritage Statement argues is 'insensitive' and 'has a detrimental effect upon the way in which the building is currently use'.</p>

	<p>However, the building would still be subject to substantial renovation and internal alteration under the proposal, such as replacement of doors and windows, and construction of new floor slab. The proposed development would have a likely impact on heritage assets with archaeological interest. On this basis, there should be the following provisions made:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The archaeological building recording of the standing structure in its present form, before any development commences. 2. the archaeological recording of all interventions to the fabric of the building in areas where such works might reveal additional information relating to the development of the building, and for the purpose of recording any original historic features (etc.) that may be exposed; 3. The analysis of the results of the archaeological work, with provisions for the subsequent production of a report and an archive, and the publication of the results, as appropriate. 4. Such other provisions as may be necessary to protect the archaeological interests of the site. <p>In this case a condition should be imposed to ensure that a historical record is kept of any archaeological finds due to the implementation of the development and to comply with Policy R29 and the National Planning Policy Framework.</p>
Conclusion	
<p>Subject to conditions, the proposed development would not significantly impact upon the special interest of the Listed Building nor have any adverse impact on archaeology. The proposal would be acceptable to the provisions of the National Planning Policy Framework 2012, Policy R29 of the Local Plan 2005 and Policy SADM 15 of the Draft Local Plan Proposed Submission 2016.</p>	

Conditions:

1. No development shall commence until a detailed survey to show how the removal of the suspended ceiling to the entrance lobby and the removal of the internal partition walls (which form the existing kitchen and bar, between the entrance lobby and the main hall) has been carried out. This survey shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Subsequently the works shall not be carried out other than in accordance with the approved details, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

REASON: To ensure the historic and architectural character and setting of the building is properly maintained, in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework and SADM15 of the Draft Plan Proposed Submission 2016.

2. The brickwork, roof tile, bond, mortar, detailing, guttering, soffits and other external decorations of the approved alterations must match the existing building in relation to colour and texture.

Reason: In order to preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the Listed Building. In accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework 2012, and SADM15 of the Draft Plan Proposed Submission 2016.

3. Following the carrying out of completion of the building operations or alterations for which consent is hereby granted, all making good of the existing building shall be

carried out in materials and finishes which closely match, like for like, those historic materials and finishing detailed used in the existing building or structure. If there is any doubt regarding the approach to any proposed making good, or any alternative materials are proposed, a precise specification of the materials and finishes shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Subsequently the works shall not be carried out other than in accordance with the approved details, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

REASON: To ensure the historic and architectural character and setting of the building is properly maintained, in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework and SADM15 of the Draft Plan Proposed Submission 2016.

4. No development shall take place until an Archaeological Written Scheme of Investigation has been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing. The scheme shall include an assessment of archaeological significance and research questions and:
 1. The programme and methodology of site investigation and recording;
 2. The programme for post investigation assessment;
 3. Provision to be made for analysis of the site investigation and recording;
 4. Provision to be made for publication and dissemination of the analysis and records of the site investigation;
 5. Provision to be made for archive deposition of the analysis and records of site investigation; and
 6. Nomination of a competent person or persons/organisation to undertake the works set out within the Archaeological Written Scheme of Investigation.

The development shall not be implemented other than in accordance with the programme of archaeological works set out in the approved Archaeological Written Scheme of Investigation.

The development shall not be occupied until the site investigation and post investigation assessment has been completed in accordance with a programme set out in the approved Written Scheme of Investigation and provision made for analysis and publication where appropriate.

REASON: To ensure that a historical record is kept of any archaeological finds due to the implementation of the development and to comply with the National Planning Policy Framework 2012 and Policy R29 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005.

DRAWING NUMBERS

5. The development/works shall not be started and completed other than in accordance with the approved plans and details:

Plan Number	Revision Number	Details	Received Date
HHCH/103		Existing East & West Elevations	21 November 2017
HHCH/113		Proposed Radiator Details	21 November 2017
HHCH/111		Proposed Details - Kitchen	21 November 2017
HHCH/115		Proposed Lift Details	21 November 2017
HHCH/105		Proposed Sections	21 November 2017
HHCH/101		Proposed Floor Plan	21 November 2017

HHCH/110		Proposed Lobby Plan	21 November 2017
HHCH/114		Proposed Counter Details	21 November 2017
HHCH/106		Site Plan & Proposed Landscaping	21 November 2017
HHCH/102		Existing North & South Elevations	21 November 2017
HHCH/112		Proposed Stair Details	21 November 2017
HHCH/104		Existing Sections	21 November 2017
Site Location Plan		Site Location Plan	10 November 2017
HHCH/116		Proposed Reroofing Details	21 November 2017
180110-501	P1	Sustructure Plan	23 January 2018
HHCH/120		Existing plan	23 January 2018
HHCH/115		Lift details	23 January 2018

REASON: To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans and details.

1. POSITIVE AND PROACTIVE STATEMENT

The decision has been made taking into account, where practicable and appropriate the requirements of paragraphs 186-187 of the National Planning Policy Framework and material planning considerations do not justify a decision contrary to the development plan (see Officer's report which can be viewed on the Council's website or inspected at these offices).

Informatives:

1. This permission does not convey any consent which may be required under any legislation other than the Town and Country Planning Acts. Any permission required under the Building Regulations or under any other Act, must be obtained from the relevant authority or body e.g. Fire Officer, Health and Safety Executive, Environment Agency (Water interest etc. Neither does this permission negate or override any private covenants which may affect the land.
2. The granting of this permission does not convey or imply any consent to build upon or access from any land not within the ownership of the applicant.