### The Planning Inspectorate

For official use only (Date received)

8-Jun-2012 15:28

# CERTIFICATE OF LAWFUL USE OR DEVELOPMENT APPEAL (Online Version)

**APPEAL REFERENCE:** 

APP/C1950/X/12/2177638

#### A. APPELLANT DETAILS

Name

Mr M Vignali

Address

45 Kentish Lane Brookmans Park

HATFIELD Hertfordshire

IELD Fax no

Postcode AL9 6NG

Please confirm how you wish to correspond with us:

Electronically, via the email address specified above 🗸

On paper, by post.

Phone no.

#### B. AGENT DETAILS (IF ANY) FOR THE APPEAL

Name

Mr Graham Fisher (qfplanning Limited)

Address

1 Woodlands Avenue

LONDON

Your reference GF/758

Phone no. (0208) 5301306

Fax no

Postcode E11 3RA

E-mail

gfplanning@hotmail.com

Please confirm how you wish to correspond with us:

Electronically, via the email address specified above ✓

On paper, by post.

#### C. LOCAL PLANNING AUTHORITY (LPA) DETAILS

Name of local planning authority (LPA) Welwyn Hatfield Council

16 Apr 2012

Date of application to LPA 15 Feb 2012

Date of decision (if any)

Application Reference

S6/2012/0348/LUP

number

1

#### D. APPEAL SITE ADDRESS

Address of site (please give full address)
45 Kentish Lane
Brookmans Park
HATFIELD
Hertfordshire

Postcode AL9 6NG

Grid Reference: Easting 05262233

Northing 02046969

Are there any health and safety issues at, or near, the site which the Inspector

YES 🗸

NO

would need to take into account when visiting the site?

#### E. DETAILS OF THE APPEAL

I appeal under section 195(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended), against:

V

The decision of the LPA refusing/refusing in part to grant a certificate of lawful use or development, OR

The LPA's failure to give notice of their decision within the appropriate period on an application for a certificate of lawful use or development.

Give a precise description of the proposed or existing use, operation or activity as outlined in the application in respect of which a certificate is sought (Continue on a separate sheet if necessary)

Detached garage

State whether the application was made under section 191 or 192?

191

192 🗸

In the case of a proposal, had it been started before the application to the LPA was YES made?

NO 🗸

Actual use of site at the time of application to the LPA (If not in use, write 'nil' and state last known use)
Residential garden and curtilage

#### F. APPEAL STATEMENT

This should be a clear and concise statement of your full case and the reason(s) why you consider the subject of the application to be lawful.

(Please note that the planning merits of what has been applied for are not relevant in deciding an application or an appeal; it rests entirely on the facts involved in each case).

Please continue on a separate sheet if necessary.

\*\* See separate documents \*\*

. (	CHOICE OF PROCEDURE			
ere a	e 3 possible procedures:- written representations, hearings and inqui	ries. You	should co	nsider
	which method suits your circumstances before selecting your preferr			tne b
	IE WRITTEN REPRESENTATIONS PROCEDURE			
(fo	or an explanation refer to the guidance leaflet) his is normally the simplest, quickest and most straightforward way of making	an anneal		
	Could the Inspector see the relevant parts of the appeal site sufficients.		res	NO
a,	to judge the proposal from public land?	ariery 1	E3	NO
b)		nents v	/ES	NO
Ξ.	or other relevant facts?	·	23	110
	If so, please explain below or on a separate sheet.			
			i	
			:	
	HE HEARING PROCEDURE		<del></del>	•
•	or an explanation refer to the guidance leaflet)	!!!! !	:	مالمان
Th	his procedure is likely to be suited to more complicated cases which require de erits of a proposal. Although you may indicate a preference for a hearing, the	stalled disci Inspectora	ussion abol te must als	nt the
CC	insider that your appeal is suitable for this procedure. You must give detailed	reasons be	elow or on	a
56	parate document why you think a hearing is necessary.			
	** See separate documents **			
a)	and the second of the second o			NO
	to tell us about? If so please explain below.			
	•		•	
т	IE INQUIRY PROCEDURE			
	or an explanation refer to the guidance leaflet)			_
•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
	nis is the most formal of procedures. Although you may indicate a pre-		r an Inqui	ry tne
	spectorate must also consider that your appeal is suitable for this pro			
Y	ou must give detailed reasons below or on a separate sheet why you t	inink an in	iquiry is n	ecessa
			]	
а	) How long do you estimate the inquiry will last?	No. of da	ays	
	(Note: We will take this into consideration, but please bear in			
	mind that our estimate will also be informed by others' advice and our own assessment.)			
h		No. of w	itnesses	
D	) How many witnesses do you intend to call?	140. OF W		
С	) Is there any further information relevant to the inquiry which you		YES   ·	NO
	need to tell us about? If so, please explain below.			
	Please continue on a separate sheet if necessary.			
	e de la companya del companya de la companya del companya de la co		•	
			•	
				•

#### H. OTHER APPEALS

Have you made any other appeals to the Secretary of State on this, or nearby land, YES for example, against a refusal of planning permission?

NO 🗸

If yes, please give details, including our reference number, if known.

#### I. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS

Please enclose with the appeal form a copy of each of the following documents and tick the appropriate box for each document.

'√'

- 1 The application made to the LPA;
- ✓ 2 Each of the plans, drawings and documents sent to the LPA as part of the application they considered;
- ✓ 2i List of plans, drawings and documents (stating drawing numbers) submitted with the application to the LPA.
- √ 3 The LPA's decision (if any);
  - 4 All other relevant correspondence with the LPA;
- √ 5 A plan showing the site marked in red, in relation to two named roads (preferably on an extract from the relevant 1:10,000 Ordnance Survey map);
- √ 6 Copies of any additional plans, drawings and documents sent to the LPA, but which did not form part of the original application (e.g. drawings for illustrative purposes).
- ✓ 6i A list of all plans, drawings and documents (stating drawing numbers) which did not form part
  of the original application.

#### J. CHECK SIGN AND DATE

I have filled in all parts of the form

I have attached all supporting documents ticked in section I.

I have clearly marked the relevant plans

I have sent a copy of this form and any documents to the LPA

Date 8 June 2012

Please tick '✓'

Name (in capitals) Mr Graham Fisher

On behalf of (if applicable) Mr M Vignali

The gathering and subsequent processing of the personal data supplied by you in this form, is in accordance with the terms of our registration under the Data Protection Act 1998. Further information about our Data Protection policy can be found in the guidance leaflet.

#### K. NOW SEND

• Send a copy to the LPA • You may wish to keep a copy of the completed appeal form for your records.

Send a copy of the appeal form to the address from which the decision notice was sent (or to the address shown on any letters received from the LPA). There is no need to send them all the documents again, send them any supporting documents not previously sent as part of the application. If you do not send them a copy of this form and documents, we may not accept your appeal.

When we receive your appeala form, we will write to you letting you know if your appeal is valid, who is dealing with it and what happens next.

#### L. APPEAL DOCUMENTS

Please remember that any supporting documentation needs to be received by us within the appropriate deadline for the case type.

We will not be able to validate the appeal until all the necessary supporting documents are received.

Please ensure that anything you do send by post is clearly marked with the reference number:

#### APP/C1950/X/12/2177638

```
*************
* The Documents Listed Below Were Uploaded With The Appeal Form *
****************
======== APPEAL SITE ADDRESS ========
TITLE:
            Health and Safety Issues
DESCRIPTION: Health and Safety Issues
FILENAME:
            00 H&S.pdf
======== SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS ========
TITLE:
            01. The application made to the LPA.
DESCRIPTION: application form
FILENAME:
            01 application form.pdf
            02. Copies of all plans, drawings and documents sent to the LPA as part of
TITLE:
            the application. The plans and drawings should show all boundaries and
            coloured markings given on those sent to the LPA. Please number them
           clearly and list the numbers here or
DESCRIPTION: drawing 11015 11
FILENAME:
             02 11015-11.pdf
            02. Copies of all plans, drawings and documents sent to the LPA as part of
TITLE:
            the application. The plans and drawings should show all boundaries and
            coloured markings given on those sent to the LPA. Please number them
            clearly and list the numbers here or
DESCRIPTION: drawing 11015 12
             03 11015-12.pdf
FILENAME:
             02. Copies of all plans, drawings and documents sent to the LPA as part of
TITLE:
            the application. The plans and drawings should show all boundaries and
            coloured markings given on those sent to the LPA. Please number them
            clearly and list the numbers here or
DESCRIPTION: drawing 11015 13
FILENAME:
             04 11015-13.pdf
             02. Copies of all plans, drawings and documents sent to the LPA as part of
TITLE:
            the application. The plans and drawings should show all boundaries and
            coloured markings given on those sent to the LPA. Please number them
            clearly and list the numbers here or
DESCRIPTION: drawing 11015 14
FILENAME:
             05 11015-14.pdf
             02i. A list of all plans, drawings and documents (stating drawing numbers)
TITLE:
            submitted with the application to the LPA.
DESCRIPTION: document list
             00 document list.pdf
FILENAME:
             03. The LPA's decision (if any).
TITLE:
DESCRIPTION: LPA's decision
FILENAME:
             06 LPA Decision.pdf
             05. A site plan (preferably on a copy of an Ordnance Survey map at not less.
TITLE:
            than 10,000 scale) showing the general location of the proposed development and its boundary. This plan should show two named roads so as to assist
            the location of the appeal si
DESCRIPTION: site plan
FILENAME:
             12 location plan 11015-5A.pdf
             06. Copies of any additional plans, drawings and documents sent to the LPA
TITLE:
            but which did not form part of the original application (e.g. drawings for
            illustrative purposes).
```

Continued in Section M

#### M. SUPPLEMENTARY SHEET

#### Appeal Documents (continued)

DESCRIPTION: supporting statement 07 SUPPORTING STATEMENT.pdf FILENAME: 06. Copies of any additional plans, drawings and documents sent TITLE: to the LPA but which did not form part of the original application (e.g. drawings for illustrative purposes). DESCRIPTION: ss appendix 1 08 APPENDIX 1.pdf FILENAME: 06. Copies of any additional plans, drawings and documents sent TITLE: to the LPA but which did not form part of the original application (e.g. drawings for illustrative purposes). DESCRIPTION: ss appendix 2 FILENAME: 09 APPENDIX 2.pdf 06. Copies of any additional plans, drawings and documents sent TITLE: to the LPA but which did not form part of the original application (e.g. drawings for illustrative purposes). DESCRIPTION: supplementary statement FILENAME: 10 SUPPORTING STATEMENT SUPPLEMENTARY.pdf 06. Copies of any additional plans, drawings and documents sent TITLE: to the LPA but which did not form part of the original application (e.g. drawings for illustrative purposes). DESCRIPTION: supplementary appendix 11 SUPPORTING STATEMENT APPENDIX.pdf FILENAME: 06i. A list of all plans, drawings and documents (stating TITLE: drawing numbers) which did not form part of the original application. DESCRIPTION: document list FILENAME: 00 document list.pdf APPEAL STATEMENT \_\_\_\_\_ Appeal Statement DESCRIPTION: grounds of appeal FILENAME: 00 grounds of appeal.pdf CHOICE OF PROCEDURE ======== Choice of procedure - reasons for hearing TITLE: DESCRIPTION: hearing reasons FILENAME: 00 hearing reasons.pdf

#### 45 KENTISH LANE, BROOKMANS PARK, HERTFORDSHIRE, AL9 6NG

#### CERTIFICATE OF LAWFULNESS APPEAL BY M VIGNALI

#### **GROUNDS OF APPEAL**

N.B. The appellant's case comprises these grounds and the submitted supporting and supplementary statements, but the right is reserved to expand and amplify these.

- Having regard to its physical features, its relationship with the remainder of the appeal site (including the dwellinghouse) and relevant case law and appeal decisions, it is considered that the land comprising the rear part of the appeal site (where the proposed building would be sited) forms part of the curtilage of the dwellinghouse.
- 2. A garage is commonly accepted as being a building required for a purpose incidental to the enjoyment of a dwellinghouse. A garage of the size proposed is not disproportionate compared to the size of the dwellinghouse it would serve. The location of the proposed garage and its access arrangements would ensure an incidental relationship with the dwellinghouse. Therefore, the development is required for a purpose incidental to the enjoyment of the dwellinghouse.
- 3. As agreed by the LPA, the development complies with all the limitations set out in Class E of Part 1 of the Schedule to the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (No. 2) (England) Order 2008.
- 4. Therefore, the development is permitted by that Order and would be lawful.

## 45 KENTISH LANE, BROOKMANS PARK, HERTFORDSHIRE, AL9 6NG CERTIFICATE OF LAWFULNESS APPEAL BY M VIGNALI – DOCUMENT LIST

#### **List of Application Documents**

- 1. Application Form
- 2. Drawing no 11015/11
- 3. Drawing no 11015/12
- 4. Drawing no 11015/13
- 5. Drawing no 11015/14
- 6. LPA's Decision
- 7. Supporting Statement
- 8. Supporting Statement Appendix 1
- 9. Supporting Statement Appendix 2
- 10. Supplementary Statement
- 11. Supplementary Statement Appendix

#### Not Included With Original Application

12, Location Plan 11015/5A

#### 45 KENTISH LANE, BROOKMANS PARK, HERTFORDSHIRE, AL9 6NG

## CERTIFICATE OF LAWFULNESS APPEAL BY M VIGNALI – HEALTH AND SAFETY ISSUES

There are large dogs kept at the property, so the Inspector's site visit needs to be accompanied.

#### 45 KENTISH LANE, BROOKMANS PARK, HERTFORDSHIRE, AL9 6NG

## CERTIFICATE OF LAWFULNESS APPEAL BY M VIGNALI - REASONS FOR ELECTING FOR A HEARING

The main issues in this appeal are:

- 1. Whether the rear part of the application site lies within the residential curtilage of the dwellinghouse at no 45 Kentish Lane.
- 2. Whether the proposed building can be considered as required for a purpose incidental to the enjoyment of the dwellinghouse.

In respect of these matters, we consider that it will be critical to the determination of the appeal to discuss in detail the application of relevant appeal decisions and court cases to the proposed development. It will be equally critical to examine the physical features of the rear part of the application site and its relationship with the remainder of the site, including the dwellinghouse.

The hearing procedure is ideally suited to achieve the above, as the decision will turn on the interpretation of appeal decisions and court cases and the discussions involved will not include any dispute of facts. Moreover, the ability to continue the hearing discussions at the site visit will be particularly valuable to the Inspector's appreciation of the case.

Your attention is also drawn to decision APP/Y3615/C/11/2161968 which forms document 11 in the appeal bundle, where a hearing was used in respect of an appeal with similar issues.



#### **Planning Development Control**

Welwyn Hatfield Borough Council The Campus, Welwyn Garden City, Herts AL8 6AE

> Telephane: 01707 357000 Fax: 01707 357255 Email: planning@welhat.gov.uk

Website: www.welhat.gov.uk

## Putting people first.

Application for a Lawful Development Certificate
for a Proposed use or development.
Town and Country Planning Act 1990: Section 192,
as amended by section 10 of the Planning and Compensation act 1991.
Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2010

Publication of applications on planning authority websites.

Please note that the Information provided on this application form and in supporting documents may be published on the Authority's website. If you require any further clarification, please contact the Authority's planning department.

1. Applicant N	ame, Address and Contact Details			`
Title: Mr	First name: M	Surname: Vigr	nali	h.
Company name				e.
Street address:	45 Kentish Lane	]	Country	umber
		Telephone number:	No Charles and the control of the co	
		Mobile number:	MERNING L	
Town/City	Brookmans Park	Fax number:	CTTY PE COPY	
County:		Email address:	2 0 FEB 2012	
Postcode:	AL9 6NG	·	: 2012/03/8	
	acting on behalf of the applicant? ( Yes	C No N	0.=	
Z. Agent Nam	e, Address and Contact Details  First Name: Philip	Surname: Nici	holas .	
Company name:	Building Design Consultants	1		esan.
Street address:	47 Deer Park Way	<u>.</u> ]		ension s mber
		Telephone number:	01992 768866	
		Mobile number:		
Town/City	Waltham Abbey	Fax number:		
County:	Essex	Emall address:		
Country: Postcode:	United Kingdom EN9 3YN	dawn@building-design	n-consultants.co.uk	

	Details						
Full postal address	of the site (including full postcode where available)  Description:						
House:	45 Suffix:						
House name:							
Street address:	KENTISH LANE						
	BROOKMANS PARK						
Town/City:	HATFIELD						
County:							
Postcode:	AL9 6NG						
	on or a grid reference						
·	If postcode is not known):  526223						
Easting:	204697						
Northing:	204097						
4. Pre-applicati	on Advice						
	or advice been sought from the local authority about this application? Yes © No						
5. Lawful Devel	opment Certificate - Interest in Land						
Please state the app	licant's Interest in the land: ( a) Owner ( b) Lessee ( c) Occupier ( d) Other						
6. Authority Em	ployee/Member						
(b) an ele (c) relate	nber of staff ected member d to a member of staff id to an elected member						
-	Do any of these statements apply to you? Yes No						
<u>:</u>							
7. Grounds for	Application .						
Information about	the existing use(s)						
Please explain why y lawful:	rou consider the existing or last use of the land is lawful, or why you consider that any existing buildings, which it is proposed to alter or extend are						
Residential use							
Please list the suppo							
Trease list tite suppe	rting documentary evidence (such as a planning permission) which accompanies this application:						
If you consider the e	xisting documentary evidence (such as a planning permission) which accompanies this application:  xisting or last use is within a "Use Class" in the Town  g (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:						
If you consider the e	xisting or last use Is within a "Use Class" in the Town						
If you consider the e and Country Plannir Information about If you consider the p	xisting or last use is within a 'Use Class' in the Town  In g (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:						
If you consider the e and Country Plannir Information about If you consider the p	xisting or last use is within a "Use Class" in the Town  Ig (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  C3  The proposed use(s)  Troposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  C3  C3						
If you consider the e and Country Plannin Information about If you consider the p Country Planning (U Is the proposed open Why do you conside	xisting or last use is within a "Use Class" in the Town  In g (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  C3  The proposed use(s)  Transposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  C3  C3  Transposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  Transposed use:  Permanent  Temporary  That a Lawful Development Certificate should be granted for this proposal?						
If you consider the e and Country Plannir Information about If you consider the p Country Planning (U Is the proposed ope Why do you conside It complies with artic	xisting or last use is within a "Use Class" in the Town  ig (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  C3  the proposed use(s)  roposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  ration or use:  Permanent  Temporary  r that a Lawful Development Certificate should be granted for this proposal?  Ile 3, part 1, class E of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (No 2) (England) Order 2008						
If you consider the e and Country Plannin Information about If you consider the p Country Planning (U Is the proposed open Why do you conside	xisting or last use is within a "Use Class" in the Town  ig (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  C3  the proposed use(s)  roposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  ration or use:  Permanent  Temporary  r that a Lawful Development Certificate should be granted for this proposal?  Ile 3, part 1, class E of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (No 2) (England) Order 2008						
If you consider the e and Country Plannin Information about If you consider the p Country Planning (U is the proposed ope Why do you conside it complies with article 8. Description Country Planning Country Plan	xisting or last use is within a 'Use Class' in the Town  g (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  C3  the proposed use(s)  roposed use is within a 'Use Class' in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  ration or use:  Permanent Temporary  r that a Lawful Development Certificate should be granted for this proposal?  C1: C2: C3  Proposal  Onsist of, or include, the carrying out of building or other operations?  PYES  No						
If you consider the e and Country Plannir Information about If you consider the p Country Planning (U Is the proposed ope Why do you conside it complies with article B. Description Coes the proposal cult Yes, please give destreet; construct any	existing or last use is within a "Use Class" in the Town ag (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  C3  the proposed use(s)  roposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and see Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  cation or use:  Permanent  Temporary  r that a Lawful Development Certificate should be granted for this proposal?  C1						
If you consider the e and Country Plannir Information about If you consider the p Country Planning (U Is the proposed open Why do you consider It complies with articologies the proposal country Planning (I I Complies with articologies the proposal country Planning (I Yes, please give destreet; construct any Detached garage	xisting or last use is within a "Use Class" in the Town  g (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  the proposed use(s)  roposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  cation or use:  Permanent Temporary  r that a Lawful Development Certificate should be granted for this proposal?  rie 3, part 1, class E of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (No 2) (England) Order 2008  onsist of, or include, the carrying out of building or other operations?  Yes No  tailed descriptions of all such operation and indicate on your plans (includes describing any proposal to alter or create a new access, layout or any new associated hardstandings; means of enclosure; or draining the land/building)						
If you consider the e and Country Plannir Information about If you consider the p Country Planning (U Is the proposed open Why do you consider It complies with articological Complete Why do you consider It complies with articological Complete Why do you consider It complies with articological Complete Why do you consider It complies with articological Complete Why do you consider It complies with articological Complete Why do you consider It complies with a construction of the cons	xisting or last use Is within a "Use Class" in the Town Ig (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) state which one:  C3  the proposed use(s)  roposed use is within a "Use Class" in the Town and se Classes) Order 1987 (as amended), state which one:  C3  ration or use:  Permanent Temporary  r that a Lawful Development Certificate should be granted for this proposal?  rite 3, part 1, class E of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (No 2) (England) Order 2008  onsist of, or include, the carrying out of building or other operations?  Yes No  tailed descriptions of all such operation and indicate on your plans (includes describing any proposal to alter or create a new access, layout or any new associated hardstandings; means of enclosure; or draining the land/building)  onsist of, or include, a change of use of the land or building(s)?  Yes No						

In the site be seen from a public road, public footpath, bridleway or other public land?  Yes No  The planning authority needs to make an appointment to carry out a site visit, whom should they contact? (Please select only one)							
The agent ( The applicant ( Other person							
0. Declaration	<u> </u>						
/we hereby apply for a Lawful Development Certificate as described in his form and the accompanying plans/drawings and additional nformation.	$\boxtimes$	Date:	15/02/2012	*. *			
Varning: The amended section 194 of the 1990 Act provides that it is an offence to furnisi Information with intent to deceive. Section 193(7) enables the authority to revol Information.	h false or misleading ke, at any time, a cert	information or Ificate they ma	to withhold material y have issued as a result of such fals:	e or misleading			

Visit