

WELWYN HATFIELD COUNCIL – DEVELOPMENT CONTROL
DELEGATED REPORT

APPLICATION No:	S6/2009/0565/LB
------------------------	------------------------

NOTATION:

The site lies within a Green Belt area of Brookmans Park as designated in the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005.

DESCRIPTION OF SITE:

Mymwood House was built as a residential dwelling around 1820 and is a two-storey, detached, white rendered building with a pitched slate roof. Mymwood House has a single storey, flat roofed extension to the rear. The building has been used as a residential care home for the elderly since the mid-1980's and before this had been used as a boarding school from the 1930's. Mymwood house is set back from the highway by approximately 65m. To the front of the site is a detached building Mymwood Lodge which is the application building. Both Mymwood House and Mymwood Lodge are Grade II Listed Buildings. The site lies within the Metropolitan Green Belt and to the east of the settlement of Brookmans Park.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:

The application seeks Listed Building Consent to demolish a previous rear extension and a side extension and to replace these with new larger extensions for office accommodation.

The proposed side elevation is approximately 3.1m wide and 5.8m deep and the rear extension is also the same size. Both these extensions are the same size as the existing wing to the building.

The proposed materials are white render to the walls to match the existing and welsh slates to the pitched roofs to also match those on the existing building. The windows are timber and of a detailed design to match the existing sash windows.

PLANNING HISTORY:

S6/1983/592/FP – Change of use from school house to office – Refused.

S6/1984/519/FP – Change of use from school to residential home for the elderly – Granted.

S6/1985/601/FP – Construction of fire escape stairs in connection with change of use of existing building to old people's home – Granted.

S6/2005/225/FP – Alterations and Extensions to Care Home – Refused

S6/2005/226/LB – Alterations and Extensions to Care Home – Refused.

S6/2007/422/MA – Removal of pre-fabricated buildings and erection of extensions to provide 13 additional bedrooms and ancillary accommodation – Planning application Approved.

S6/2007/0421/LB – Removal of pre-fabricated buildings and erection of extensions to provide 13 additional bedrooms and ancillary accommodation – Pending consideration.

S6/2007/1711/LB – Erection of single storey and basement level extensions – Approved.

S6/2007/1724/MA – Erection of single storey and basement level extensions – Approved.

S6/2008/556/LB – Internal Alterations – Approved

S6/2008/693/MA - Removal of condition 5 (age restriction) of previous planning application S6/2007/422/FP – Approved

S6/2009/695/MA - removal of condition 5 (age restriction) of previous planning application S6/2007/1704/FP – Approved

SUMMARY OF DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES:

National Policy
PPG15: Planning and the Historic Environment

East of England Plan 2008
ENV6 – The Historic Environment

Hertfordshire Structure Plan Review 1991 – 2011:
None.

Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005:
None.

CONSULTATIONS

The Conservation Officer (Beams) – the following comments were received:

'I visited the site, have inspected the lodge & read the BEAMS Historical Assessment (Sallianne Wicox, March 2004) & the BEAMS advice relating to the pre-application enquiry (Russ Craig, 1 September 2008). As you mention in your earlier e-mail, there has been considerable alteration to the lodge & some of this has been poorly handled & is damaging to the special interest, character & appearance of this small listed building. In order to encourage some degree of re-instatement of the original form & appearance of the lodge some extension would therefore seem acceptable in principle- as suggested by Russ in the earlier BEAMS advice. That advice points the way forward, I feel, in the suggestion for a rear single storey linked extension.

The proposed single storey side & rear extensions would, it is considered, however carefully handled in terms of selection of sympathetic materials, rather swamp the small scale form & massing of the lodge- & thus, inevitably, diminish its integrity as a

purpose-built functional building. As such they could be refused consent on that basis- that the extensions would be detrimental to the special interest, character & appearance of the Grade II listed lodge house by reason of the design- specifically the position & scale/ massing relative to the original building.

The benefit of this link to a new separate building approach, to providing additional required accommodation, is that the lodge can be returned to its original plan form & elevational appearance by the removal of the ugly 20th century extension & reinstatement of altered elements- hip tiles (replaced with lead roll hips/ ridge), window, door, cast iron rwgs. A lightweight link could then connect to a new outbuilding-type structure- which could be distinctly different in appearance & seem like a subordinate storage building, perhaps constructed of painted weatherboarding, with a slate hipped roof, lead roll hips & ridge & cast iron rwgs.

With thoughtful siting of the new linked outbuilding- & suitable hedging/planting- the new work could then appear subservient & relatively low-key & recessive juxtaposed with the preserved lodge.

Parish Council Comments – No comments received.

REPRESENTATIONS

One letter of representation was received in regards to requesting information about availability of plans on the website. Concerns that a change of use to the main house may be proposed and that the application is not for a new building which would harm the landscape.

Period expired 27 May 2009.

DISCUSSION:

The main issues are:

- 1. The impact upon the setting of the adjacent Grade II Listed Building and on the character and historic fabric of the listed building.**

Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 & East of England Plan 2008 Policy ENV6 are the only relevant planning policies as no relevant ones have been 'saved' in the Local Plan.

The building is Grade II Listed and the schedule describes the building as:

'Lodge. 1840 Single storey lodge to Mymwood School. Painted stucco. Slate hipped roof. L shaped. Forward projecting left part has central 4- panel door with plain hood on large curved brackets. 1 8/8-pane recessed sash window each side, and another in right hand part. Tall central stack. Included for group value.'

The Councils Conservation advisor (BEAMS) have visited the site and building and note that there has been considerable alteration to the lodge and some of this has been poorly handled and damaging to the listed building

BEAMS advice is that some form of re-instatement of the original form and appearance would be acceptable in principle, but should only be limited to a lightweight linked rear extension. This link could be distinctly different in appearance

and appear as a subordinate extension. This would avoid the extensions swamping the small scale form and massing of the lodge.

These comments by BEAMS were based on a revised set of drawings which were submitted where the side extension had been reduced so that it was a mirror image of the existing wing. A further set of drawings have also been received which have reduced the rear extension so that it has the same proportions as the other wings.

It is acknowledged that the existing Lodge has been considerably altered and that its interest as noted in the Listings schedule is for 'group value'.

The relationship with the main house is therefore particularly important, along with its character. The main house has a formal and mainly symmetrical appearance, whereas the existing lodge is unbalanced. The proposals would add a side wing which would create a balance and the removal of the unsympathetic rear extensions and the addition of a new extension of a similar style would reinforce this symmetry.

BEAMS concerns over the extensions swamping the original small scale character of the lodge are noted, however, the character of this building when viewed from the public highway, and from the front would still retain the essential character of this Lodge structure.

On balance, it is considered that the extensions will still maintain the original character of the lodge and also provide an opportunity to remove later extensions which are harmful. The existing materials should be easily matched subject to their agreement through appropriate planning conditions.

CONCLUSION:

The proposed extensions are considered not to adversely affect the character and appearance or historic fabric of the Listed Building. The application is therefore considered to be acceptable and to meet the requirements of PPG15 and ENV6

RECOMMENDATION: APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

CONDITIONS:

1. C.2.2 – Time Limit Full Permission (Listed Buildings)
2. C.13.1 – The development/works shall not be started and completed other than in accordance with the approved plans and details
JDA/0/9175/PL.006 received and date stamped 03/04/09 &
JDA/0/9175/PL. REV/007A & JDA/0/9175/PL.REV/008A &
JDA/0/9175/PL. 002B received and date stamped 29/05/09 unless
otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority:

REASON: To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved drawings and any changes must be agreed in advance in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

3. The roof to the extensions hereby permitted shall be clad with natural slate, in accordance with details, which have been submitted to and approved in

writing by the local planning authority. Subsequently, the materials shall not be changed without the prior written consent of the local planning authority.

REASON : To ensure a satisfactory standard of development in the interests of visual amenity in accordance with Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 and East of England Plan 2008 Policy ENV6.

4. The windows and their cills of the extensions hereby permitted shall be constructed and installed in accordance with approved drawing JDA/0/9175/PL.006 received and date stamped 03/04/09. The window frames and shall be painted to match those of the existing windows (white) and cills (Green). Subsequently, the materials shall not be changed without the prior written consent of the local planning authority.

REASON: To protect the historic fabric and aesthetic quality of the Listed Building in accordance with Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 and East of England Plan 2008 Policy ENV6.

5. The walls to the extension hereby permitted shall have a white painted rendered surface to match the existing render style of the existing listed building. A sample panel of the render and painted finish is to be prepared for inspection by the Local Planning Authority (at least 7 days notice is to be given) and, if satisfactory, approval in writing by the local planning authority will be given before rendering is commenced to the approved extensions. Subsequently, the materials shall not be changed without the prior written consent of the local planning authority.

REASON: To protect the historic fabric and aesthetic quality of the Listed Building in accordance with Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 and East of England Plan 2008 Policy ENV6.

6. All rainwater goods to the extension hereby permitted shall be black, in accordance with details, which have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Subsequently, the materials shall not be changed without the prior written consent of the local planning authority.

REASON: To protect the historic fabric and aesthetic quality of the Listed Building in accordance with Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 and East of England Plan 2008 Policy ENV6.

SUMMARY OF REASONS FOR THE GRANT OF PERMISSION:

The proposal has been considered against Planning Policy Guidance 15, East of England Plan 2008 Policy ENV6 and the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005, in addition to the Human Rights Act 1998, which indicate that the proposal should be approved. Material planning considerations do not justify a decision contrary to the Development Plan (see Officer's report which can be inspected at these offices).

INFORMATIVES:

None.

Signature of author..... Date.....