

WELWYN HATFIELD COUNCIL
PLANNING CONTROL COMMITTEE – 16 FEBRUARY 2006
REPORT OF THE CHIEF PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH OFFICER

S6/2005/1561/FP & S6/2005/1562/LB

ERECTION OF REPLACEMENT RESIDENTIAL ANNEX AND REPLACEMENT OF EXISTING FLAT ROOF GARAGE WITH PITCHED ROOF. AMENDMENT TO S6/2001/1389/FP & S6/2001/1447/LB AT THE VINES, HIGH ROAD, ESSENDON, HATFIELD

APPLICANT: Mr & Mrs S Cadisch

Hatfield East

1 Site Description

- 1.1 The Vines is a large detached dwelling located on the western side of the High Road, within the Green Belt settlement of Essendon. It is accessed via a private drive set behind other residential properties and the dwelling sits in a plot of 1.2 hectares and is surrounded by a walled garden, part of this wall being Grade II Listed. The site is located within the Essendon Conservation Area and is within the Metropolitan Green Belt.
- 1.2 Planning permission and listed building consent were granted in 1999 (S6/1999/672/FP & 695/LB) for a replacement garden building in the form of a traditional barn-like structure to be used as a residential annex. Amendments to this scheme were subsequently approved in 2001 under S6/2001/1389/FP & 1447/LB and comprised an increase of the ridge height of the lower section of the roof over the garage to match that of the main roof and the removal of rear gables. The scheme consented in 2001 has not yet been implemented.
- 1.3 A subsequent scheme for a more contemporary-design of residential annex was refused in May 2005.

2 The Proposal

- 2.1 The application seeks permission for further amendments to the scheme approved in 2001 comprising changes to the structure as follows:
- Insertion of glazed panels to front elevation in place of previously approved fenestration;
 - Glazing of covered entrance corridor;
 - Enlargement of dormer window to front roof slope.
 - Erection of chimney for a wood burning stove to western end of main roof.
- 2.2 All other aspects of the proposed structure are to remain the same as was approved in 2001.

2.3 Proposed external materials are to be clay roof tiles with brickwork and green Oak timber panels.

3 Planning History

- 3.1 S6/2005/0350/LB Partial demolition of summer house to create a one bedroom annex – Refused
- 3.2 S6/2005/0349/FP Partial demolition of summer house to create a one bedroom annex – Refused
- 3.3 S6/2001/1389/FP Erection of replacement residential annexe and replacement of existing flat garage roof with pitched roof (amendment to S6/0672/99/FP) - Granted
- 3.4 S6/2001/1447/LB Erection of replacement residential annexe and replacement of existing flat roof garage with pitched roof (amendment to S6/0695/99/LB) - Granted
- 3.5 S6/2001/0051/FP Alteration to existing crossover and construction of two brick piers - Granted
- 3.6 S6/2000/1581/FP Erection of replacement garden store (revision to planning application ref no S6/1999/673/FP) – Granted
- 3.7 S6/2000/1582/LB Removal of existing storage shed and replacement with new garden store and workshop - Granted
- 3.8 S6/1999/695/LB Erection of replacement residential annexe and replacement of existing flat garage roof with pitched roof – Granted
- 3.9 S6/1999/696/LB Removal of existing storage shed and replacement with new garden store and workshop - Granted
- 3.10 S6/1999/673/FP Replacement garden store - Granted
- 3.11 S6/1999/672/FP Erection of replacement residential annexe and replacement of existing flat garage roof with pitched roof - Granted
- 3.12 S6/1992/496/FP Demolition of existing single storey rear extension; erection of part two storey, part single storey rear extension; rear conservatory; alterations - Granted
- 3.13 S6/1992/497/CA Demolition of existing single storey rear extension - Granted
- 3.14 S6/1989/236/FP Erection of rear conservatory and flat roof covered area – Granted
- 3.15 S6/1980/223/FP Rear extension – Granted
- 3.16 S6/1980/340/FP Conservatory – Granted

4 Planning Policy

- 4.1 Planning Policy Guidance Note 2 (PPG2): Green Belts
- 4.2 Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 (PPG15): Planning and the Historic Environment
- 4.3 Hertfordshire Structure Plan Review 1991- 2011:

Policy 5: Green Belts

Policy 38: Critical Capital and Other Environmental Assets

4.4 Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005:

GBSP1 – Definition of Green Belt

R22 – Development in Conservation Areas

RA3 – Extensions to dwellings in the Green Belt

D1 – Quality of Design

D2 – Character and Context

R25 – Works to Listed Buildings

4.5 Supplementary Design Guidance (Statement of Council Policy)

4.6 Supplementary Planning Guidance Parking Standards (Adopted January 2004)

5 Representations Received

5.1 **Neighbouring Occupiers** - The applications were advertised by the display of a site notice posted on 22 December 2005 and letters were sent to neighbouring occupiers on 21 December 2005.

5.2 A letter of objection has been received from the owner/occupier of The Limes commenting that if permission is granted that the occupiers of this property would hope that there would be a restriction to windows on the south side and also since the drive is a shared one, a limitation requiring that the building be used for purposes ancillary to the occupation of the main dwelling.

5.3 **Essendon Parish Council** – recognise that the applicant has amended the design of the structure to make it more traditional in style. Nevertheless, the proposal fails to address any of the other areas of concern:-

1. It would be relatively easy to convert the proposal into a separate dwelling, independent of the main house.
2. The proposal is too large and massive and would have a detrimental impact on the adjacent listed buildings.
3. The proposal will facilitate a substantial increase in the number of vehicles using the site and its restrictive access with consequent increased danger from entry and egress from busy High Road.

5.4 The Parish Council recommends that for the above reason, size, form and bulk the applications is refused as contrary to the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan.

5.5 Should approval be granted by WHDC the parish council recommends that the Council apply the restrictive condition imposed on the previous plan (S6/2001/1389/FP) to ensure the annex is used in conjunction with and ancillary too the use of the Vines as a single family dwelling and shall not be let, sold or otherwise occupied as a separate residential unit.

5.6 BEAMS (Built Environment and Management Service) – Recommends approval subject to conditions requiring approval of samples of materials and details of doors and windows to an appropriate scale.

6 Discussion

6.1 The main issues relate to the acceptability of the revisions to the design of annex now proposed in terms of their impact on the appearance of the existing dwelling at The Vines and whether the revised scheme continues to preserve and enhance the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area.

6.2 The other major consideration is the impact the design revisions may have on the Grade II Listed wall on which it is to be built. The principle of the development has already been established by the planning and listed building consents granted in 2001. The building now proposed has the same dimensions as was approved in 2001 and so no additional floorspace or bulk is proposed above that already approved. Therefore, there can be no requirement to re-assess this proposal in terms of its appropriateness within the context of the Metropolitan Green Belt.

6.3 The proposed structure is to be erected against an historic wall that formerly surrounded a kitchen garden and this section of wall is Grade II Listed. Policy R25 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005 states that permission will be refused for any proposal which would adversely affect the historic character or architectural quality of a Listed Building or its setting. Listed Building consent will not be granted for any extension or external or internal alterations to buildings of special architectural or historic importance unless all the following criteria are satisfied:

- (i) New works respect the character, appearance and setting of the building in terms of design, scale and materials;
- (ii) Architectural or historic features which are important to the character and appearance of the building (including internal features) are retained unaltered;
- (iii) The historic form and structural integrity of the building are retained; and
- (iv) Full detailed drawings of the proposed works are submitted with the application.

6.4 The site is also located within the Essendon Conservation Area within which Policy R22 is relevant and this policy states that proposals will only be permitted where they would preserve or enhance the character and appearance of the Conservation Area in terms of siting, form, scale, materials, detailing and landscaping.

6.5 Mr Craig (BEAMS) comments that although this is not strictly what he had in mind when negotiations took place with the applicants [following refusal of S6/2005/349/FP and S6/2005/350/LB] he feels that we have reached the end of the road as far as improvements are concerned. Very little information has been submitted regarding the proposed materials and the need for ventilation. The latter may require interruption of the large sheets of glass. Mr Craig recommends approval subject to the submission and approval of samples of materials and details of doors and windows to an appropriate scale to show details.

6.6 Overall, subject to the imposition of conditions as recommended above, it is considered that the revisions to the design of the residential annex approved in 2001 are acceptable. The changes to the treatment of the front elevation of the structure

comprising glazing in of the covered walkway, the enlarged dormer window, changes to fenestration and insertion of a chimney for a wood burning stove are considered not to detract from the listed wall and its setting in the Conservation Area and are acceptable.

- 6.7 It is considered that because the size, height and location of the proposed annex is to be the same as was approved in 2001, the proposed annex will not have an overbearing impact on the neighbouring occupiers nor will the building bring about a loss of daylight or sunlight to occupiers of adjacent property. Similarly, a condition imposed to control the insertion of windows in the southern elevation of the annex (ie as was imposed on the 2001 consent) would prevent overlooking into the garden of the adjacent property.
- 6.8 The proposals have no implications in terms of parking. Existing provision is more than adequate, no additional bedrooms are proposed over and above what has already been granted planning permission.

7 Conclusion

- 7.1 The proposed residential annex is of a sufficiently high quality design in this location and compliments and reflect the design and character of its setting adjoining an historic wall which is a Grade II Listed structure. The form and detailing of the proposed changes to the external design of the structure preserve and enhance the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. Subject to the imposition of conditions as recommended, the proposal is considered to be acceptable and in accordance with Policies D1, R25 and R22 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005.

8 Recommendation

- 8.1 That planning application S6/2005/1561/FP be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. SC01 – Time Limit Full Permission
2. SC19 – Materials samples to be submitted
3. No windows, including roof lights or dormers, shall be installed in the southern elevation of the residential annex hereby approved

REASON: To maintain the privacy of the adjacent residential property. To comply with Policy D1 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005 and Supplementary Design Guidance (Statement of Council Policy)

4. The residential annex hereby approved shall be used and occupied only in conjunction with and ancillary to the use of The Vines as a single family dwelling and shall not be let, sold or otherwise occupied as a separate residential unit.

REASON: The property is within the Metropolitan Green Belt wherein the use of the annex as a separate dwelling would be contrary to the aims of Policy RA1 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005.

5. The development works hereby permitted shall not be commenced until larger scale detailed plans and drawings showing the design of doors and windows have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning

Authority. The development shall not be carried out except as in accordance with details so approved.

REASON: To ensure that the appearance of the building relates acceptably to the historic integrity of the listed wall building in compliance with Policies R22 and R25 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005.

8.2 SUMMARY OF THE REASONS FOR THE GRANT OF PLANNING PERMISSION

8.3 It is considered that the proposed development does not have an unacceptably harmful impact on residential amenity or the character of the area in which it is located, preserves and enhances the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area and will not result in unacceptable overlooking or loss of privacy for neighbouring occupiers.

8.4 That application S6/2005/1562/LB for Listed Building consent be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. SC02 – Time Limit Full Permission – Listed Buildings
2. SC19 – Materials samples to be submitted
3. The development works hereby permitted shall not be commenced until larger scale detailed plans and drawings showing the design of doors and windows have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall not be carried out except as in accordance with details so approved.

REASON: To ensure that the appearance of the building relates acceptably to the historic integrity of the listed wall building in compliance with Policies R22 and R25 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005.

8.5 SUMMARY OF THE REASONS FOR THE GRANT OF LISTED BUILDING CONSENT

8.6 The proposal would enhance the historic character and appearance of the Listed wall. This accords with Policy R25 of the Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005.

C J Conway, Chief Planning and Environmental Health Officer
Date 2 February 2006

Background papers:

- S6/2001/1389/FP and S6/2001/1447/LB
- Welwyn Hatfield District Plan 2005



